

Instructor: Sheila Jasanoff (sheila_jasanoff@harvard.edu)
Office hours: Monday, 1:30-3:30 pm, and by appt.; KSG, Room L354
Assistant: Elta Smith (ecsmith@fas.harvard.edu)
Office hours: TBA [ROOM?]

ENVIRONMENTAL POLITICS (ESPP-78) M/W/(F) 10:00 – 11:00 AM, HUCE Seminar Room

Course Description

This course introduces students to the history, evolution, and contemporary forms of environmental politics in the United States, with a primary focus on events since the 1960s. Lectures, discussion sections, projects, and readings are designed with the following aims: to provide an overview of key environmental writings, actors, institutions, processes, and events; discuss major stages in American environmental thought and their reflection in policy; introduce important policy concepts (e.g., risk, regulation, sustainability, environmental justice); relate shifts in US environmental politics to developments in other countries and emerging global perspectives; and develop critical tools for environmental policy analysis.

The semester is organized around two analytic strands. The first strand investigates the tensions between environmental politics and rational problem-solving. Under this heading, we look at how science, law, economics, and ethics are used both as political instruments and as means of taking issues out of politics. The second strand tracks the historical progression of U.S. environmental policy: politics of nature; politics of pollution; and politics of sustainability. Issues that cut across the spectrum of environmental politics include the indeterminacy of environmental knowledge, the nature and causes of controversy, the role of ethics and values in environmental disputes, the aims and achievements of activism, and the place of American environmentalism in relation to international and global politics. By addressing these cross-cutting issues, students will gain critical insight into what Americans value about the environment and how their values are, or are not, translated into effective political action.

Readings

- 1) **Required** book (available at the Coop):
M.E. Kraft and N.J. Vig, eds., *Environmental Policy from the 1970s to the Twenty-First Century*, 5th edition (Congressional Quarterly Press, 2003).
- 2) **Optional** books (available at the Coop and on Reserve at Lamont and Hilles Libraries):
S. Jasanoff and M. Martello, eds., *Earthly Politics: Local and Global in Environmental Governance* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2004).
W. Cronon, ed., *Uncommon Ground: Rethinking the Human Place in Nature* (New York: Norton, 1996).
J.A. Tickner, ed., *Precaution: Environmental Science and Preventive Public Policy* (Washington, DC: Island Press, 2003).
- 3) **Unless otherwise indicated**, all readings are posted to the course website (VIG= *Environmental Policy: New Directions for the Twenty-first Century*; RESERVE= Lamont/Hilles Library).

Requirements & Grading

Section attendance and short essays	10%
In-class Midterm Exam	20%
Research paper (2500 words)	20%
Research project	20% (2-3 pp. memo and in-class presentation)
Final Exam	30%

SYLLABUS

I. INTRODUCTION: What is Environmentalism?

Monday, September 17: Syllabus and Requirements

- M.E. Kraft and N.J. Vig, Chapter 1 (“Environmental Policy from the 1970s to the Twenty-First Century”), 1-33. [VIG]
W. Cronon. “A Place for Stories: Nature, History, and Narrative,” *Journal of American History* March (1992):1347-76 [background reading, required by last week of November].

Wednesday, September 19: Environmental Goals and Values

- W. Cronon, *Changes in the Land* (New York: Hill and Wang, 1983), Chapter 3 (“Seasons of Want and Plenty”), 34-53.
B. McKibben, *The End of Nature* (New York: Doubleday, 1989), Chapter 2 (“The End of Nature”), 47-91.
J. Jacobs, *Death and Life of Great American Cities* (New York: Random House, 1961), Chapter 5 (“The uses of neighborhood parks”), 89-111.
R.C. Paehlke, “Environmental Sustainability and Urban Life in America,” 57-77. [VIG]
M. Shellenberger and T. Nordhaus. “The Death of Environmentalism: Global Warming Politics in a Post-Environmental World.”(2004), http://www.thebreakthrough.org/blog/PDF/Death_of_Environmentalism.pdf

II. SCIENCE

Monday, September 24: Science and Environmental Controversy

- C. Mooney, *The Republican War on Science* (New York: Basic Books, 2005), Ch. 2 (“Political Science 101”), 14-24.
Union of Concerned Scientists, “Scientific Integrity in Policy Making: Further Investigation of the Bush Administration’s Misuse of Science,” July 2004 [see particularly Introduction and Executive Summary of February 2004 report; July update report], http://www.ucsusa.org/scientific_integrity/interference/reports-scientific-integrity-in-policy-making.html
S. Jasanoff, *The Fifth Branch: Science Advisers as Policymakers* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1990), Ch. 4 (“Peer Review and Regulatory Science), 61-83.
F. Laird, “The Decline of Deference: The Political Context of Risk Communication,” *Risk Analysis* 9:543-550 (1989).
Pew Center on Global Climate Change, “The Day After Tomorrow: Could Abrupt Climate Change Really Happen?” <http://www.pewclimate.org/dayaftertomorrow.cfm>
C. Dean, “Even Before Its Release, World Climate Report Is Criticized as Too Optimistic,” *The New York Times*, Wednesday, August 8, 2007, <http://select.nytimes.com/search/restricted/article?res=F30C14F73E5B0C718CDDAB0894DF404482>
Open Letter to Martin Durkin, Managing Director, Wag TV, April 24, 2007, <http://www.climateofdenial.net/>
In class screening: extracts from *An Inconvenient Truth* and *The Great Global Warming Swindle*

Wednesday, September 26: Constructing Science (and Technology)

- B. Latour, *Science in Action* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1987), Chapter 2 (“Laboratories”), 63-79.
Also recommended: pp. 79-100
T.J. Pinch, “Testing—One, Two, Three ... Testing!”: Toward a Sociology of Testing”, *Science, Technology and Human Values* 18: 25-41 (1993).
<http://links.jstor.org.ezpl.harvard.edu/sici?sici=0162-2439%28199324%2918%3A1%3C25%3A%22-OTTT%3E2.0.CO%3B2-I>
S. Jasanoff, “Is Science Socially Constructed – And Can It Still Inform Public Policy?” *Science and*

Monday, October 1: Risk and Uncertainty

- R.N.L. Andrews, "Risk-Based Decision Making: Policy, Science and Politics," 215-238. [VIG]
- J.D. Graham and J.B. Wiener, "Confronting Risk Tradeoffs," in Graham and Wiener, eds., *Risk versus Risk* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1995), Chapter 1 ("Confronting Risk Tradeoffs"), 1-41.
- P. Slovic, "Beyond Numbers: A Broader Perspective on Risk Perception and Risk Communication," in D.G. Mayo and R. Hollander, eds., *Acceptable Evidence: Science and Values in Risk Management* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1991), 48-65.
- National Research Council, *Understanding Risk* (Washington, DC: National Academy Press, 1996), Chapter 1 ("The Idea of Risk Characterization"), 11-35.
- H.I. Miller, "A Rational Approach to Labeling Biotech-Derived Foods," *Science* 284:1471-1472 (1999, May 28).
- A. Pollack, "Grass Created in Lab Is Found in the Wild," *New York Times*, 16 August 2006, 13
http://web.lexisnexis.com.ezp1.harvard.edu/sourceselect/returnToSearch.asp?csisrc=6742&srcpdn=academic&fss=Y&after=0:ALL&date=RNG&frm_rng=08/16/06&to_rng=08/16/06&T1=grass+created+in
- G. M. Lamb, "When Genetically Modified Plants Go Wild," *Christian Science Monitor*, 31 August 2006, 15,
http://web.lexisnexis.com.ezp1.harvard.edu/sourceselect/returnToSearch.asp?csisrc=7945&srcpdn=academic&fss=Y&after=0:ALL&date=RNG&frm_rng=08/31/06&to_rng=08/31/06&T1=when+genetically+modified

Wednesday, October 3: Knowledge and Citizenship

- J. Corburn, "Street Science: Characterizing Local Knowledge", in *Street Science: Community Knowledge and Environmental Health Justice* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2005), 47-77.
- B. Wynne, "Public Uptake of Science: A Case for Institutional Reflexivity," *Public Understanding of Science* 2: 321-337 (1993).
- F. Fischer, "Environmental Regulation and Risk-Benefit Analysis: From Technical to Deliberative Policy Making." In: R. Paehlke and D. Torgerson, eds. *Managing Leviathan: Environmental Politics and the Administrative State* (Broadview Press, 2005), 59-80.
- S. Jasanoff, "Science and Environmental Citizenship," in P. Dauvergne, ed., *Handbook of Global Environmental Politics* (Cheltenham, UK: Edward Elgar, 2005), 365-382.
- J. Harr, *A Civil Action* (New York: Random House, 1995). "The Trial," 293-376 [RESERVE]
- D. DeLillo, *White Noise*, (New York: Viking, 1985). Part II ("The Airborne Toxic Event"), 109-163.

Monday, October 8: No Class (Columbus Day)

Wednesday, October 10: Risk and Precaution

- K. Foster, P. Vecchia and M. Repacholi, "Science and the Precautionary Principle," *Science* 288: 979-980 (2000).
- D. Gee and A. Stirling, "Late Lessons from Early Warnings: Improving Science and Governance under Uncertainty and Ignorance," in J. A. Tickner, ed., *Precaution, Environmental Science, and Preventive Public Policy* (Washington: Island Press, 2003), 195-213.
- T. O'Riordan and A. Jordan, "The Precautionary Principle in Contemporary Environmental Politics." *Environmental Values* 4:191-212 (1995).
- S. Jasanoff, "A Living Legacy: The Precautionary Ideal in American Law," in Tickner, ed., *Precaution*, 227-240
- Greenpeace, "Canadian Atlantic Fisheries Collapse," <http://archive.greenpeace.org/~comms/cbio/canod.html>
- B. Thorne-Miller, "Fisheries and the Precautionary Principle," in Tickner, ed., *Precaution*, 69-82.

Monday, October 15: Risk, Culture, and Global Governance

- S. Jasanoff, "Product, Process, or Programme: Three Cultures and the Regulation of Biotechnology," in M. Bauer, ed., *Resistance to New Technology* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 311-331.

- A. Gupta. "When Global Is Local: Negotiating Safe Use of Biotechnology." in S. Jasanoff and M. Long Martello, eds., *Earthly Politics: Local and Global in Environmental Governance* (Cambridge, MA: MIT, 2004), 127-148.
- D. Winickoff et al., "Adjudicating the GM Food Wars: Science, Risk, and Democracy in World Trade Law," *Yale Journal of International Law*, Vol. 30 (2005), pp. 81-123.
http://web.lexisnexis.com.ezpl.harvard.edu/sourceselect/returnToSearch.asp?csisrc=172860&srcpdn=academic&fss=Y&after=0:ALL&date=RNG&frm_rng=01/01/05&to_rng=12/31/05&T1=adjudicating+the+gm
- PEW Initiative on Food and Biotechnology, "U.S. vs. EU: An Examination of the Trade Issues Surrounding Genetically Modified Food," <http://pewagbiotech.org/resources/issuebriefs/europe.pdf>

III. ECONOMICS AND MARKETS

Wednesday, October 17: Valuing Nature

- G. Hardin, "The Tragedy of the Commons," *Science* 162:1243-1248 (1968).
- E. Ostrom et.al., "Revisiting the Commons: Local Lessons, Global Challenges," *Science* 284:278-282 (1999).
- D. Worster, *Nature's Economy* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1977), Chapter 13 ("The Value of a Varmint"), 258-290.
- M. Sagoff, *The Economy of the Earth* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), Chapter 4 ("Fragile Prices and Shadow Values"), 74-98.
- M. Sagoff, "Do We Consume Too Much?" *The Atlantic Monthly* (June 1997), 80-96.

Monday, October 22: Thinking in Markets

- "Survey: The invisible green hand," *The Economist* 364:19 (2002). http://web.lexis-nexis.com.ezpl.harvard.edu/universe/document?_m=25862c7a0fe90a43c637c659a1b92975&_docnum=1&wcp=hp=dGLzVlz-zSkVb&_md5=31625c7b3c928f310f091b9713871ee0
- A. DePalma, "Seven States Agree on a Regional Program to Reduce Emissions from Power Plants," *New York Times*, 21 December 2005, B1:3.
http://web.lexisnexis.com.ezpl.harvard.edu/sourceselect/returnToSearch.asp?csisrc=6742&srcpdn=academic&fss=Y&after=0:ALL&date=RNG&frm_rng=12/21/05&to_rng=12/21/05&T1=seven+states+agree
- Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI) web site, www.rggi.org
- HM Treasury, "Stern Review on the economics of climate change," http://www.hm-treasury.gov.uk/independent_reviews/stern_review_economics_climate_change/stern_review_report.cfm (read Summary of Conclusions, Executive Summary)
- Mike Hulme, "The Limits of the Stern Review for Climate Change Policy-Making," *Bulletin of the British Ecological Society* 38(1): 20-21 (March 2007), http://www.mikehulme.org/?page_id=7.

Wednesday, October 24: Economics – Dilemmas of Analysis

- A.M. Freeman III, "Economics, Incentives, and Environmental Policy," 193-214. [VIG]
- K.A. Arrow et al., "Is there a Role for Benefit-Cost Analysis in Environmental, Health, and Safety Regulation," *Science* 272:221-222 (1996).
- P.A. Diamond and J.A. Hausman, "Contingent Valuation: Is Some Number Better than No Number?" *Journal of Economic Perspectives* 8(4):45-64 (1994).
- J.D. Graham and J.B. Wiener, "Confronting Risk Tradeoffs," in Graham and Wiener, eds., *Risk versus Risk* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1995), Chapter 1 ("Confronting Risk Tradeoffs"), 1-41.

Monday, October 29: Economics and Corporate Responsibility

- D. Press and D.A. Mazmanian, "The Greening of Industry: Combining Government Regulation and Voluntary Strategies," 264-287 [VIG].

- J. Karlner, *The Corporate Planet: Ecology and Politics in the Age of Globalization*, (San Francisco: Sierra Club Books, 1997), Chapter 1 (“Environment and the Crisis of Globalization”), 1-29.
- M.E. Porter and C. van der Linde, “Toward a New Conception of the Environment—Competitiveness Relationship,” *Journal of Economic Perspectives* 9: 97-118 (Fall 1995).
- United Nations, The Global Compact, <http://www.unglobalcompact.org/> [BROWSE, e.g., “About the GC”, esp “What is the Global Compact”, “The Ten Principles” and “Global Compact Governance”; also Issues (esp. Environment).]

Wednesday, October 31: * IN-CLASS MIDTERM EXAM *****

IV. LAW AND REGULATION

Monday, November 5: The Pollution Frame

- R. Carson, *Silent Spring* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1994; first published 1962), Chapter 3 (“Elixirs of Death”), 15-37.
- J. Tierney, “Fateful Voice of a Generation Still Drowns Out Real Science,” *New York Times*, June 5, 2007. <http://select.nytimes.com/search/restricted/article?res=F00D15FA3A540C768CDDAF0894DF404482>
- M.E. Kraft, “Environmental Policy in Congress,” 124-147 [VIG].
- S. Jasanoff, *The Fifth Branch: Science Advisers as Policymakers* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1990), Chapter 6 (“The Science and Policy of Clean Air”), 101-122.
- R. Nixon, “The President’s Message on the Environment, February 10, 1970” *Environmental Quality: The First Annual Report of the Council on Environmental Quality* (Washington, D.C.: USGPO, 1970), Appendix C, 254-271.
- “Reorganization Plans Nos. 3 and 4 of 1970,” *Congressional Record* 116 (1970), 6523 (H.Doc.Nos. 91-364, 91-365, 91-366), <http://www.epa.gov/history/org/origins/reorg.htm>
- American Trucking Association v. US EPA*, 175 F. 3d 1027 (DC Cir. 1999), <http://supct.law.cornell.edu/supct/html/99-1257.ZS.html>

Wednesday, November 7: Regulating Uncertainty

- W.A. Rosenbaum, “Improving Environmental Regulation at the EPA: The Challenge in Balancing Politics, Policy, and Science,” 169-192 [VIG]
- S. Jasanoff, “Science, Politics, and the Renegotiation of Expertise at EPA,” *Osiris* 7:195-217 (1992).
- B.G. Rabe, “Power to the States: The Promise and Pitfalls of Decentralization,” 34-56 [VIG].
- Massachusetts v. Environmental Protection Agency*, 549 U.S. ____ (2007)
- L. Johannes, “Pollution Study Sparks Debate Over Secret Data,” *Wall Street Journal*, April 7, 1997, B1, B7 http://web.lexis-nexis.com.ezp2.harvard.edu/universe/document?_m=815450302b36bd618359533875bab096&_docnum=1&_chp=dGLbVlb-zSkVb&_md5=5b416037656cca7d7194787d2e055fc0
- R. Weiss, “‘Data Quality’ Law is Nemesis of Regulation,” *The Washington Post*, 16 August 2004, A01. http://web.lexisnexis.com.ezp1.harvard.edu/sourceselect/returnToSearch.asp?csisrc=8075&srpcdn=academic&fss=Y&after=0:ALL&date=RNG&frm_rng=08/16/04&to_rng=08/16/04&T1=data+quality+law

Monday, November 12: No Class (Veterans Day)

Wednesday, November 14: Trade and Environment

- D. Vogel, “International Trade and Environmental Regulation,” 354-373. [VIG]
- J. Layzer, “Dolphins, Sea Turtles, and the Role of International Trade in Protecting the Global Environment,” Chapter 12 in *The Environmental Case: Translating Values into Policy*, 2nd ed. (Washington, DC: CQ Press, 2006), 313-345.

WTO, Shrimp-Turtle Decision, www.wto.org/English/tratop_e/dispu_e/58abr.pdf

Monday, November 19: Pesticides and Toxic Substances

- S. Jasanoff, "Technological Risk and Cultures of Rationality," in National Research Council, *Incorporating Science, Economics and Sociology in Developing Sanitary and Phytosanitary Standards in International Trade: Proceedings of a Conference* (Washington, DC: National Academy Press), 65-84.
- M. Cone, "Beyond Silent Spring: A Global Assault on Sex Hormones and Immune Systems," in Cone, *Silent Snow: The Slow Poisoning of the Arctic* (Grove Press: 2006), 144-159.
- Commission of the European Communities. "White Paper: Strategy for a future chemicals policy", Brussels, COM(2001)88 final, eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/site/en/com/2001/com2001_0088en01.pdf (32 pp.)
- Commission of the European Communities, Registration, Evaluation and Authorisation of Chemicals (REACH) Programme, <http://europa.eu.int/comm/environment/chemicals/reach.htm> [browse]
- "The Chemical Industry, the Bush Administration, and European Efforts to Regulate Chemicals." Committee on Government Reform Minority Office, US House of Representatives. <http://oversight.house.gov/story.asp?ID=427> [Read the report (21 pp.), browse through the supporting documentation.]
- "European Environmental Rules Propel Change in US," *New York Times*, July 6, 2004. <http://query.nytimes.com/gst/fullpage.html?res=9C0CEEDA163BF935A35754C0A9629C8B63&sec=health&spn=&partner=permlink&exprod=permlink>

Wednesday, November 21: Takings

- R. O'Leary, "Environmental Policy in the Courts," 148-168 [VIG].
- Dolan v. City of Tigard*, 512 US 687 (1994). <http://supct.law.cornell.edu/supct/html/93-518.ZS.html> Read the 'syllabus' and court opinion; skim dissents by Stevens and Souter.
- Tahoe-Sierra Preservation Council, Inc., et al. v. Tahoe Regional Planning Agency et al.*, 535 U.S. ___ (2002), <http://news.findlaw.com/hdocs/docs/environment/tahoe42302uscopn.pdf>

V. ETHICS

Monday, November 26: Environmental Ethics – History and Scope

- B. Szerszynski, *Nature, Technology and the Sacred* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2005), Ch. 6 ("The Birth of the Environment"), pp. 84-107.
- W. Cronon, "The Trouble with Wilderness; or, Getting Back to the Wrong Nature," 69-90.
- D. Harvey, "The Environment of Justice," in F. Fischer and M. Hajer, *Living with Nature: Environmental Politics as Cultural Discourse* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), 153-160.
- M. Keller, "The Scandal at the Zoo," *New York Times*, August 6, 2006, 1. http://web.lexisnexis.com.ezp1.harvard.edu/sourceselect/returnToSearch.asp?csisrc=6742&srcpdn=academic&fss=Y&after=0:ALL&date=RNG&frm_rng=08/06/06&to_rng=08/06/06&T1=the+scandal+at
- J. Berger, "Bronx Zoo Plans to End Elephant Exhibit," *New York Times*, February 7, 2006. <http://www.nytimes.com/2006/02/07/nyregion/07elephants.html?ex=1296968400&en=0e864c1a4cfb6e71&ei=5088&partner=rssnyt&emc=rss>

Wednesday, November 28: Environmental Justice

- E. Ringquist, "Environmental Justice: Normative Concerns, Empirical Evidence, and Governmental Action," 239-263. [VIG]
- G. DiChiro, "Nature as Community: The Convergence of Environment and Social Justice," 298-320.
- D. Crockett, "Transforming Chattanooga into an Environmental City" in: S. Lerner ed., *Eco-Pioneers: Practical Visionaries Solving Today's Environmental Problems* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press), 171-196.

Presidential Documents. 1994 Executive Order: Federal Actions to Address Environmental Justice, <http://www.dotcr.ost.dot.gov/documents/ycr/eo12898.pdf>

Monday, December 3: Rights of Environmental Others

- C.D. Stone, *Should Trees Have Standing?* (Los Altos, CA: William Kaufmann, 1974), 3-54.
- S. Schrepfer, "Establishing Administrative 'Standing': The Sierra Club and the Forest Service, 1897-1956" in C. Miller, ed., *American Forests: Nature, Culture, and Politics* (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 1997), 125-142.
- M. Long Martello, "Negotiating Global Nature and Local Culture: The Case of Makah Whaling," in Jasanoff and Martello, eds., *Earthly Politics*, 263-284.
- N.D. Schwartz, "Far from the Reservation, but Still Sacred?" *New York Times*, August 12, 2007, <http://www.nytimes.com/2007/08/12/business/yourmoney/12tribe.html?ex=1187582400&en=3977fadf8f91203a&ei=5070&emc=eta1>

Wednesday, December 5: The Ethic of Sustainability

- N.J. Vig and M.E. Kraft, "Toward Sustainable Development?," 374-394. [VIG]
- World Commission on Environment and Development, *Our Common Future* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1987), Chapter 1 ("A Threatened Future"), 27-42; Chapter 2 ("Towards Sustainable Development"), 43-66.
- S. Jasanoff. "Heaven and Earth: The Politics of Environmental Images." in Jasanoff and Martello, eds., *Earthly Politics*, 31-52.
- J.A. Tickner and C. Raffensperger, "The Precautionary Principle: A Framework for Sustainable Business Decision-making," *Corporate Environmental Strategy* 5(4):75-82 (Summer 1998).

Monday, December 10: Environmental Human Rights

- M. Goldman. "Imperial Science, Imperial Nature: Environmental Knowledge for the World (Bank)." in Jasanoff and Martello, eds., *Earthly Politics*, 55-80.
- F. Biermann, "Strengthening Green Governance in a Disparate World Society," *International Environmental Agreement* 2:297-315 (2002).
<http://proquest.umi.com.ezp1.harvard.edu/pqdlink?index=9&did=330932711&SrchMode=3&sid=3&Fmt=10&VInst=PROD&VType=PQD&RQT=309&VName=PQD&TS=1138740598&clientId=11201&aid=1>
- A. Roy, "The Greater Common Good," <http://www.narmada.org/gcg/gcg.html>
"Toxic Memo," *Harvard Magazine* 103(5), May-June 2001:36, <http://www.harvardmagazine.com/online/050171.html>

Wednesday, December 12: [IN-CLASS PROJECT PRESENTATION]

Monday, December 17: The Way Ahead

- J.G. Speth, "Perspectives on the Johannesburg Summit," *Environment*, January/February 2003, 24-29. [Also, browse Johannesburg Summit web site, <http://www.un.org/events/wssd/> to see what was achieved and key documents.]
- B. McKibben, *Hope, Human and Wild: True stories of living lightly on the earth* (St. Paul, MN: Hungry Mind Press, 1995), Chapter 2 ("Curitiba"), 59-115.
- R. Guha, *How Much Should a Person Consume? Thinking through the Environment* (Delhi: Permanent Black, 2006), 220-250.
- S.M. Meyer, *The End of the Wild* (Somerville: Boston Review, 2006), Chapter 6 ("Our Moral Obligation"), 73-88.